

A CAT(0)-VALUED POINTWISE ERGODIC THEOREM

TIM AUSTIN

ABSTRACT. In this note we prove the following pointwise ergodic theorem for functions taking values in a separable complete CAT(0)-space:

Theorem. Suppose that G is an amenable locally compact group with left Haar measure m_G and that $(F_n)_{n \geq 1}$ is a tempered Følner sequence of compact subsets of G , that $T : G \curvearrowright (\Omega, \mathcal{F}, \mathbb{P})$ is a jointly measurable, probability-preserving action of G on a probability space, that (X, d) a separable complete CAT(0)-space with barycentre map b , and that $f : \Omega \rightarrow X$ is a measurable function such that for some (and hence any) fixed $x \in X$ we have

$$\int_{\Omega} d(f(\omega), x)^2 \mathbb{P}(d\omega) < \infty.$$

Then as $n \rightarrow \infty$ the functions of empirical barycentres

$$\omega \mapsto b\left(\frac{1}{m_G(F_n)} \int_{F_n} \delta_{f(T^g \omega)} m_G(dg)\right)$$

converge pointwise for almost every ω to a T -invariant function $\bar{f} : \Omega \rightarrow X$.

1. INTRODUCTION

Suppose that $(\Omega, \mathcal{F}, \mathbb{P})$ is a probability space and (X, d) a complete separable CAT(0)-space (see, for instance, Bridson and Haefliger [1]). We write $L^2(\mathbb{P}; X)$ for the space of all measurable maps $f : \Omega \rightarrow X$ such that for some fixed point $x \in X$ we have

$$\int_{\Omega} d(f(\omega), x)^2 \mathbb{P}(d\omega) < \infty.$$

It is easy to see that in this case this actually holds for every $x \in X$, and that if $f, g \in L^2(\mathbb{P}; X)$ then also

$$\int_{\Omega} d(f(\omega), g(\omega))^2 \mathbb{P}(d\omega) < \infty.$$

If we now define

$$d_2(f, g) := \sqrt{\int_{\Omega} d(f(\omega), g(\omega))^2 \mathbb{P}(d\omega)},$$

then this is a metric on $L^2(\mathbb{P}; X)$ that is easily seen to be also complete and CAT(0), and separable if $\mathcal{F}$ is countably generated up to $\mathbb{P}$ -negligible sets.

In addition, let $P_2(X)$ be the collection of probability measures on X with finite second moment, in that sense that $\mu \in P_2(X)$ if for some (and hence every) $x \in X$ we have

$$\int_X d(y, x)^2 \mu(dy) < \infty.$$

In these terms the condition that $f \in L^2(\mathbb{P}; X)$ is equivalent to $f_{\#} \mathbb{P} \in P_2(X)$, where $f_{\#} \mathbb{P}$ is the pushforward measure of $\mathbb{P}$ under f .

The important geometric property of complete CAT(0)-spaces that motivates our work is that they support a sensible notion of averaging. More specifically, it has been known essentially since work of Cartan [2] that for any $\mu \in P_2(X)$ there is a unique point $x \in X$ for which the above integral is minimized (see Chapter II.2 of Bridson and Haefliger). We will refer to this as the **barycentre** of μ and denoted it by $b(\mu)$.

In terms of these barycentres we can now define a CAT(0)-notion of ergodic averages. Suppose that G is an amenable locally compact group with left-invariant Haar measure m_G that acts on $(\Omega, \mathcal{F}, P)$ through a jointly measurable, P -preserving action $g \mapsto T^g$. Given this, for a measurable subset $E \subseteq G$ with $m_G(E) < \infty$ and a point $\omega \in \Omega$ we will write

$$\nu_{f,E}(\omega) = \frac{1}{m_G(E)} \int_E \delta_{f(T^g\omega)} m_G(dg)$$

for the **empirical measure** of f across the associated orbit patch of T : more explicitly, this is defined by

$$\nu_{f,E}(\omega)(A) := \frac{1}{m_G(E)} m_G\{g \in E : f(T^g\omega) \in A\}.$$

It is natural to view the function of barycentres of the empirical measures of f ,

$$\omega \mapsto b(\nu_{f,E}(\omega)),$$

as a CAT(0) analog of the ergodic averages

$$\frac{1}{m_G(E)} \int_E f(T^g\omega) m_G(dg)$$

available in case $f : \Omega \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$.

In the case of real-valued functions, it is known that if $f \in L^2(P)$ then these ergodic averages converge for P -almost every $\omega \in \Omega$ as E increases along a suitably chosen Følner sequence of subsets of G . This follows from the classical pointwise ergodic theorem of Birkhoff in case $G = \mathbb{Z}$, and has also long been known for many other concrete groups such as $\mathbb{Z}^d$ or $\mathbb{R}^d$. The general case was only established quite recently by Lindenstrauss, who found that the appropriate condition to place on the Følner sequence $(F_n)_{n \geq 1}$ is that it be **tempered**: this holds if for some fixed $C > 0$ and all $n \geq 1$ we have

$$m_G\left(\bigcup_{k < n} F_k^{-1} F_n\right) \leq C m_G(F_n)$$

(this is also referred to as the ‘Shulman condition’).

By thinning out an initially-given Følner sequence if necessary it follows that any amenable group does admit Følner sequences satisfying this condition. Given such a sequence, Lindenstrauss proves (alongside other results) that for any $f \in L^1(P)$ there is a T -invariant function $\bar{f} : \Omega \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$ such that

$$\frac{1}{m_G(F_n)} \int_{F_n} f(T^g\omega) m_G(dg) \rightarrow \bar{f}(\omega)$$

for P -almost every $\omega \in \Omega$.

In the present note we will show that this result can be extended to maps in $L^2(P; X)$ for a separable CAT(0)-space X , replacing ergodic averages with the empirical measure barycentres introduced above:

Theorem 1.1. *If $T : G \curvearrowright (\Omega, \mathcal{F}, \mathbb{P})$, (X, d) are as above, then for any $f \in L^2(\mathbb{P}; X)$ there is a T -invariant function $\bar{f} : \Omega \rightarrow X$ such that for any tempered Følner sequence $(F_n)_{n \geq 1}$ of compact subsets of G we have*

$$b(\nu_{f,E}(\omega)) \rightarrow \bar{f}(\omega)$$

for $\mathbb{P}$ -a.e. $\omega \in \Omega$.

In particular, if T is ergodic then $\bar{f}$ is just the constant function with value $b(f_{\#}\mathbb{P}) \in X$.

Remark We restrict to separable X in order to avoid discussing the nuances between different notions of ‘measurability’ for f , but provided the right notion is chosen this seems to make no real restriction. $\triangleleft$

We will find that this theorem follows quite quickly from an appeal to the real-valued pointwise ergodic theorem, together with an approximation argument based on a maximal ergodic theorem for such group actions and Følner sequences also obtained by Lindenstrauss in [4]. On the other hand, since any Hilbert space is CAT(0) with barycentre map simply given by averaging, Theorem 1.1 does contain the pointwise ergodic theorem for square-integrable maps into a separable Hilbert space as a special case. It seems to be harder to find a theorem about CAT(0) targets that encompasses the real-valued theorem for arbitrary functions in $L^1(\mathbb{P})$, since the condition that $\mu \in P_2(X)$ already appears in the definition of the barycentre $b(\mu)$.

Theorem 1.1 seems to be new even in the classical case $G = \mathbb{Z}$, but it does bear comparison with various other works relating probability-preserving actions to the geometry of CAT(0)-spaces; we refer the reader in particular to the proof by Karlsson and Margulis in [3] of an analog of Oseledets’ Theorem for cocycles over a probability-preserving action taking values in the semigroup of contractions of a CAT(0)-space.

In the next section we will recall the maximal ergodic theorem we need from Lindenstrauss [4] and derive from it a useful consequence for CAT(0)-valued maps, and then in Section 3 we will use these results to prove Theorem 1.1.

Acknowledgements My thanks go to Lior Silberman for helpful suggestions. $\triangleleft$

2. A CAT(0)-VALUED MAXIMAL ERGODIC THEOREM

An important innovation behind Lindenstrauss’ proof of his pointwise ergodic theorem was a proof of the weak-(1, 1) maximal ergodic theorem in the setting of general amenable groups and tempered Følner sequences.

Let us introduce the standard notation Mf for the ergodic maximal function associated to a Følner sequence and a function $f : \Omega \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$:

$$Mf(\omega) := \sup_{n \geq 1} \frac{1}{m_G(F_n)} \int_{F_n} f(T^g \omega) m_G(dg).$$

(see, for example, Peterson’s book [5] for background on this maximal function in the classical case $G = \mathbb{Z}$, or Section 3 of Lindenstrauss [4]).

Proposition 2.1 (Theorem 3.2 of [4]). *Let $T : G \curvearrowright (\Omega, \mathcal{F}, \mathbb{P})$ be an action as above and $(F_n)_{n \geq 1}$ a tempered Følner sequence. Then there is a $c > 0$, depending on the sequence*

$(F_n)_{n \geq 1}$ but not on X , such that for any $f \in L^1(P)$ we have

$$P\{\omega \in \Omega : Mf(\omega) > \alpha\} \leq \frac{c}{\alpha} \|f\|_1$$

for all $\alpha > 0$. □

We will make use of this result to prove the following analog for CAT(0)-valued maps.

Theorem 2.2 (CAT(0)-valued maximal ergodic theorem). *If $f, h : \Omega \rightarrow X$ are two members of $L^2(P; X)$ then*

$$P\{\omega \in \Omega : \sup_{n \geq 1} d(b(\nu_{f, F_n}(\omega)), b(\nu_{h, F_n}(\omega))) > \alpha\} \leq \frac{c}{\alpha^2} d_2(f, h)^2$$

for every $\alpha \in (0, \infty)$, where c is the same constant as in Proposition 2.1.

In order to prove this, we need an elementary result controlling the behaviour of barycentres in terms of the Wasserstein metric on $P_2(X)$. Recall that this is defined for $\mu, \nu \in P_2(X)$ by

$$W_2(\mu, \nu) := \inf_{\lambda \text{ a coupling of } \mu, \nu} \sqrt{\int_{X^2} d(x, y)^2 \lambda(dx, dy)}.$$

As is standard, this defines a metric on $P_2(X)$ (see, for instance, Villani [6]), and in conjunction with the CAT(0) condition it controls barycentres as follows.

Lemma 2.3. *If $\mu, \nu \in P_2(X)$ then*

$$d(b(\mu), b(\nu)) \leq W_2(\mu, \nu).$$

Proof Since $b(\nu)$ is the barycentre of ν , for any other fixed point $x \in X$ we have

$$d(x, b(\nu))^2 \leq \int_X d(x, y)^2 \nu(dy),$$

and so integrating with respect to μ we obtain

$$\int_X d(x, b(\nu))^2 \mu(dx) \leq \int_{X^2} d(x, y)^2 \nu(dy) \mu(dx).$$

On the other hand, by the definition of $b(\mu)$ we have

$$d(b(\mu), y)^2 \leq \int_X d(x, y)^2 \mu(dx)$$

for any fixed $y \in X$; taking $y := b(\nu)$ and concatenating the above inequalities gives the result. □

Proof of Theorem 2.2 For any $\alpha > 0$ the above lemma implies that

$$\begin{aligned} \{\omega \in \Omega : \sup_{n \geq 1} d(b(\nu_{f, F_n}(\omega)), b(\nu_{h, F_n}(\omega))) > \alpha\} \\ \subseteq \{\omega \in \Omega : \sup_{n \geq 1} W_2(\nu_{f, F_n}(\omega), \nu_{h, F_n}(\omega)) > \alpha\}. \end{aligned}$$

On the other hand, for each n the measure

$$\lambda_n := \frac{1}{m_G(F_n)} \int_{F_n} \delta_{(f(T^g \omega), h(T^g \omega))} m_G(dg)$$

on X^2 is clearly a joining of $\nu_{f,F_n}(\omega)$ and $\nu_{h,F_n}(\omega)$, and so

$$W_2(\nu_{f,F_n}(\omega), \nu_{h,F_n}(\omega))^2 \leq \frac{1}{m_G(F_n)} \int_{F_n} d(f(T^g\omega), h(T^g\omega))^2 m_G(dg).$$

If we now write $F(\omega) := d(f(T^g\omega), h(T^g\omega))^2$, then combining the above observations gives

$$\{\omega \in \Omega : \sup_{n \geq 1} d(b(\nu_{f,F_n}(\omega)), b(\nu_{h,F_n}(\omega))) > \alpha^2\} \subseteq \{\omega \in \Omega : MF(\omega) > \alpha\},$$

and so now Proposition 2.1 gives

$$\mathbb{P}\{\omega \in \Omega : \sup_{n \geq 1} d(b(\nu_{f,F_n}(\omega)), b(\nu_{h,F_n}(\omega))) > \alpha\} \leq \frac{c}{\alpha^2} \|F\|_1$$

and so finally observing that $\|F\|_1 = d_2(f, h)^2$ completes the proof. $\square$

3. PROOF OF THE MAIN THEOREM

Proof of the Theorem 1.1 Let us first prove the assertion of Theorem 1.1 for a finite-valued function $h : \Omega \rightarrow X$. To this is associated some finite measurable partition $\Omega = A_1 \cup A_2 \cup \dots \cup A_m$ and collection of points $x_1, x_2, \dots, x_k \in X$ such that $h(\omega) = x_i$ when $\omega \in A_i$. This case now follows easily from Lemma 2.3 and the real-valued pointwise ergodic theorem: given $\varepsilon > 0$, for almost every $\omega \in \Omega$ and every $i \leq k$, that theorem gives some $n(\omega, k, \varepsilon) \geq 1$ such that

$$n \geq n(\omega, k, \varepsilon) \quad \Rightarrow \quad \left| \frac{1}{m_G(F_n)} m_G\{g \in F_n : T^g\omega \in A_i\} - \mathbb{P}(A_i) \right| < \varepsilon,$$

and so choosing n sufficiently this we can make this hold for this ε and ω and all $i \leq k$. It follows that the empirical measure

$$\nu_{h,F_n}(\omega) = \frac{1}{m_G(F_n)} \int_{F_n} \delta_{h(T^g\omega)} m_G(dg)$$

satisfies the total variation inequality

$$\|\nu_{h,F_n}(\omega) - \mathbb{P}(A_1)\delta_{x_1} - \mathbb{P}(A_2)\delta_{x_2} - \dots - \mathbb{P}(A_k)\delta_{x_k}\|_{\text{var}} < \varepsilon,$$

and hence that

$$W_2(\nu_{h,F_n}(\omega), \mathbb{P}(A_1)\delta_{x_1} + \mathbb{P}(A_2)\delta_{x_2} + \dots + \mathbb{P}(A_k)\delta_{x_k}) < \sqrt{\varepsilon} \text{diam}\{x_1, x_2, \dots, x_k\}.$$

Combining this with Lemma 2.3 and noting that

$$\mathbb{P}(A_1)\delta_{x_1} + \mathbb{P}(A_2)\delta_{x_2} + \dots + \mathbb{P}(A_k)\delta_{x_k}$$

is just the pushforward measure $h_{\#}\mathbb{P}$, this shows that for almost every ω , for every $\varepsilon > 0$ we have

$$d(b(\nu_{h,F_n}(\omega)), b(h_{\#}\mathbb{P})) < \sqrt{\varepsilon} \text{diam}\{x_1, x_2, \dots, x_k\}$$

for all sufficiently large n , and so since $\text{diam}\{x_1, x_2, \dots, x_k\}$ is a fixed quantity for a given h it follows that

$$b(\nu_{h,F_n}(\omega)) \rightarrow b(h_{\#}\mathbb{P})$$

as $n \rightarrow \infty$ for almost every ω .

Finally, the same assertion for an arbitrary $f \in L^2(P; X)$ follows from a routine approximation argument and appeal to Theorem 2.2. Letting $c > 0$ be the constant of Theorem 2.1 and given $\alpha > 0$, since X is separable we can always find a finite-valued function $\psi : \Omega \rightarrow X$ such that $d_2(f, \psi) < \alpha^2$, and hence

$$P\left\{\omega \in \Omega : \sup_{n \geq 1} d(b(\nu_{f, F_n}(\omega)), b(\nu_{\psi, F_n}(\omega))) > \alpha\right\} \leq \frac{c}{\alpha^2} d_2(f, \psi)^2 < c\alpha^2,$$

so since we have seen that $b(\nu_{h, F_n}(\omega)) \rightarrow b(h_{\#}P)$ for a conegligible set of $\omega \in \Omega$ it follows that outside the above subset of Ω of measure at most $c\alpha^2$, the sequence $(b(\nu_{f, F_n}(\omega)))_{n=1}^{\infty}$ asymptotically oscillates by at most α in X , and so since α was arbitrary this sequence must actually converge for almost every ω . This completes the proof. $\square$

Remark From another simple approximation by a finite-valued function as in the above proof and an appeal to the Dominated Convergence Theorem, it follows directly from Theorem 1.1 that the empirical barycentres of f also converge to $\bar{f}$ in the metric space $(L^2(P; X), d_2)$. $\triangleleft$

REFERENCES

- [1] M. R. Bridson and A. Haefliger. *Metric spaces of non-positive curvature*, volume 319 of *Grundlehren der Mathematischen Wissenschaften [Fundamental Principles of Mathematical Sciences]*. Springer-Verlag, Berlin, 1999.
- [2] É. Cartan. *Leçons sur la géométrie des espaces de Riemann*. Gauthier-Villars, Paris, 1951. 2d ed.
- [3] A. Karlsson and G. A. Margulis. A multiplicative ergodic theorem and nonpositively curved spaces. *Comm. Math. Phys.*, 208(1):107–123, 1999.
- [4] E. Lindenstrauss. Pointwise theorems for amenable groups. *Invent. Math.*, 146(2):259–295, 2001.
- [5] K. E. Petersen. *Ergodic Theory*. Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, 1983.
- [6] C. Villani. *Topics in Optimal Transportation*. American Mathematical Society, Providence, 2003.

DEPARTMENT OF MATHEMATICS, UNIVERSITY OF CALIFORNIA, LOS ANGELES, CA 90095-1555, USA

Email: timaustin@math.ucla.edu

URL: <http://www.math.ucla.edu/~timaustin>